The Impacts of Vocational Training Programs on Youth Employment in Mongolia

RESEARCH PROPOSAL
Presented to
Partnership for Economic Policy (PEP)

By
AltantsetsegBatchuluun
&SoyolmaaBatbekh
BayarmaaDalkhjav
AmartuvshinSanjmyatav
Tsogt-ErdeneBaldandorj

Mongolia

July09, 2013
This research focuses on evaluation of the impacts of short-term vocational training programs on earnings and likelihood of employment of young unemployed in Mongolia. The evaluation will be based on the randomized controlled trial. According to the NSO Population census data, in 2000, youth unemployment was 22.8 percent and in 2010 it was 20 percent. In 2008, the government has set a target to reduce youth unemployment to 2.5 percent by 2015. Vocational training program is the most popular program among young unemployed and has been implemented extensively during a last decade. Impact evaluation of the vocational training program on likelihood of youth employment is crucial for labour policy in the future. The research will collect data for both control and treatment group and estimate the impact.
2. **Main research questions and contributions**

   Explain the focus (or key questions) of your research and its policy relevance.

2.1. Explain why you think this is an interesting research question and what the potential value added of your work might be (knowledge gaps). You might want to explain whether or not this question has been addressed before in this context (including key references), and if so, what do you wish to achieve (in addition) by examining the question again?

The research question: Does short-term vocational training increase likelihood of employment of young unemployed in short and long run?

According to ILO, the global economic crisis in recent years hit young workers most hardly and high unemployment may last for a while. In Mongolia, youth unemployment is extremely high. According to the NSO Population census data, in 2000, youth unemployment was 22.8 percent and in 2010 it was 20 percent. During the last decade, the Government of Mongolia has implemented various activities to promote labour. In 2011, the Law on Employment Promotion was rewritten and adopted by the parliament. The new law includes a broad range of employment promoting policy instruments such as vocational training, competency-based training, work ethic, relation training, microcredit, and so on.

Among these instruments, vocational training is one of the oldest and widely/dominant used instrument of labour promotion. However, there is no quantitative estimate on the impact of vocational training on youth employment. There are a few studies, surveys on employment such as labour market barometer surveys (The Central Labour Exchange), labour force surveys (National Statistical Office) and household income and spending surveys (National Statistical Office). Although these surveys provide primary
data and valuable information on employment and unemployment, there is no study on the impact of employment promotion policy.

We will conduct a randomized experiment on vocational training in order to estimate the short and long run impacts of training on youth employment. In Mongolia, this type of randomized experiment has not been utilized for policy impact evaluation. Therefore, this study will fill this knowledge gap and provide valuable information on policy impact.

There is large literature on impact of Active Labour Market Programs (ALMP) in OECD countries. Ashenfeldter (1978) and Heckman et al (1999) studied the impact based on the randomized field experiment data. These studies estimate modest impact on employment and earnings in OECD countries. There are a number of studies on the impact of ALMP in developing countries with particular attention to Latin American Countries (LAC).

However, evidences on positive impact of training on employment from experimental studies in developing countries are limited. Ibarrarán and Shady (2008) and Card, Ibarrarán, Regalia, Rosas-Shady and Soares (2011) studied youth training in Dominican Republic and found little evidence of a positive effect on employment outcomes but some evidence on earnings. On the other hand, Attanasio, Kugler and Meghir (2011) studied randomized training program in Colombia and found evidence on positive impacts on earnings and employment for both man and women.

Moreover, experience of evaluation of ALMP in developing countries is limited by LAC only. For example, evaluation of the impact of ALMP using experimental design has not been conducted in Asian countries and transition countries. However, country characteristics, culture, and economic structure are very different from the LAC in these areas. This makes the
generalization of previous results for countries in these areas hard. Betchermen, Olivas and Dar (2004) emphasizes that there is still much more to learn about the impacts of ALMPs in the context of developing and transition countries. Therefore, this research will fill this knowledge gap.

In addition to the impact evaluation of ALMP, the team will conduct labour market analysis using secondary sources (survey data from NSO, ILO) of information to explore particular feature of Mongolian labour market. Mongolia certainly has some specific features in terms of its current economic changes. For example, country is expecting substantial economic growth from its mining sector, the most capital intensive sector and on the other hand, its livestock sector, which is the most labour intensive sector, is shrinking. Therefore, the labour market of Mongolia is facing a big challenge in near future.

2.2. Describe the specific policy issues/needs that your research aims to address; how your potential outcomes/findings may be used in policymaking?

- Justify timing of your research in terms of policy and socioeconomic needs/context – e.g. reference to existing/planned/potential policies at the national level.
- Evidence of previous consultation with potential users (e.g. policymakers and key stakeholders) to help define your research question is strongly encouraged. Include a list of names, institutions and email addresses when possible.

- Unusually, high youth unemployment has attracted government attention. According to the “Comprehensive Policy on National Development based on the MDG” approved in 2008, the government
has targeted to reduce the youth unemployment to 2.5 percent by 2015. However, 2010 Census data shows still high youth unemployment of 19.5 percent. There is a serious lack of information on policies targeted at youth employment, especially on the impact of policy. Although, vocational training has been used for over a decade to promote employment with special attention to young unemployed, there is no study on its impact yet. In the fourth national report on Millennium Development Goals Implementation in 2011, the government acknowledges a lack of comprehensive study on labour market and an importance of a research for better impact of labour promotion policy.

- Previously, labour related issues were responsibility of the former Ministry of Social Welfare and Labour. However, recently the new government introduced a new focus on labour market and established a new Ministry of Labour. The Ministry of Labour understands the importance of the impact evaluation of previous policies at this critical early stage of the policy reform and expresses their deep interest to cooperate on this research to use the findings of the research for policy purposes (See the attached letter from the Ministry). The study will provide evaluation of the effectiveness of vocational training on youth employment.

- The team consulted with the following key users/stakeholders about our research and its importance for policymakers. Key stakeholders acknowledged the importance of impact evaluation of the labour promotion policy and a lack of research and study on labour market policy. They were very interested in the proposed research on impact evaluation of vocational training, randomized experiment
methodology and research results. Key stakeholders showed their deep interest in the proposed research and agreed to cooperate with the team. The following are their contact information.

- **Ms. B. Alimaa, Director of the Labour Relations Department, Ministry of Labour, alimaab@mswl.gov.mn (b_alimaa@yahoo.com), Phone: 976-51-266241**
- **Mr. M. Chimeddorj, Director of Institute for Labour Studies, chimeddorj@solution.mn, phone: 976-88110509**
- **Ms. Ts. Bayarmaa, Head of the Labour Policy Research Department, State Labour Research Institute, phone: 976-88015951**

3. **Methodology**

Presentation of the specific techniques that will be used to answer the research questions and how exactly they will be used to do so. Explain whether you will use a particular technique normally used in other contexts or whether you intend to extend a particular method and how you will do so. Explain if these methods have already been used in the context you are interested in (including key references).

Research team will estimate short and long run impact of short-term vocational training on the youth employment, earnings and formality of the employment status by using randomized experimental method. Short-term vocational training is the largest program used in active labour market policies (ALMP) in Mongolia and have been used for more than a decade. However, there is no study on its impact on likelihood of employment in
Mongolia. At the international level, according to Card, Ibarrarán, Regalia, Rosas-Shady and Soares (2011), job training policy is one of the most rigorously studied and evaluated public policy internationally. Randomized experimental designs are widely used for ALMP evaluations and considered to be able to provide credible evidences if conducted carefully. Therefore, the team will use randomized experimental method. The team carefully studied and followed the researches and guidelines listed below to design the methodology. In particular, the team closely followed the practitioners' guide by Card, Ibarrarán, Villa (2011).

The team will sample 1551 unemployed young people and randomly assign them into treatment 1, treatment 2 and control groups equally. Those who assigned to the treatment group 1 will attend vocational training and those who assigned to treatment group 2 will attend the training and receive some information treatment.

Participants of both treatment 1, treatment 2 and control groups will be surveyed three times: (1) baseline survey, which will be taken place before the randomization, (2) first follow-up survey, which will be taken place after 6 months of the randomization, and (3) second follow-up survey, which will be taken place after 1.5 years after the training. Two follow-up surveys are planned to be conducted as research team is planning to estimate short and long run program impact of the vocational training.

A simple OLS method will be used to estimate the effect of the treatment by controlling the baseline characteristics and site differences. Limited dependent variable model – probit model will be fitted for binary outcome variables such as employment status and formality of employment.

Typical problems such as randomization, response rate to follow-up survey and non-compliance are expected. Research team is planning to take
possible preventive actions against these problems during the survey and program implementation.

Evaluating the impact of ALMP by randomized experimental study has been conducted in many countries. The following list shows some references in the field.


4. Data requirements and sources

This is a critical part of the proposal. The key issue is to explain the reason for the use of the particular data. You must establish that they are ideal for the question you wish to address. Please consult the "Guide for designing a research project proposals" for more detail.

The team will collect baseline data before random assignment. When participants applied to trainings at khoros, officials identify applicants’ eligibility for training. Eligible applicants will fill a questionnaire for the baseline survey. A questionnaire of baseline survey will include questions for the following characteristics:
• Basic individual information: Age, gender, education, marital status, dwelling type, health status, experience
• Family characteristics: number of children, number of dependents, household’s income, assets, other benefits
• Information on employment and earnings: previous and current employment status (unemployed/registered unemployed),
• Contact information in order to be in contact with participants: copy of valid identity card, phone number, relatives’ phone number, address etc.
• The purpose of the obtaining vocational skill
• Previous experience of vocational training
• Information about friends and relatives who are enrolled in the same program

The following data will be collected during the follow-up survey to capture changes in outcome variables-employment status, earnings and formality of employment:
• Employment status - whether youth is employed or not
  o Formality of employment – if employed, whether some part of workers’ social security contribution and income tax is paid by employers or not (for formal job)
  o Self-employed – whether youth is self-employed or not
• Total earnings per month- if employed, how much is his/her earnings per month
• Hours of work – if employed, how many hours he/she works per week
• Firm (employer) size defined by the number of employee

5. Policy influence plan (or research communication strategy)
• Identify potential users of your research findings, including policymakers and other key stakeholders. Provide a list of institutions and, whenever possible, specific individuals to be targeted for effective policy influence. Please also indicate whether you have already made contacts within the institution.

• How, in the elaboration and execution of your project (from design to dissemination), will you consult/communicate with these users to both gather their inputs and keep them informed of your project (expected contributions and uses), in order to increase chances of your findings to be taken-up into policymaking?

You can refer to PEP’s research communications strategy and guidance to have a better idea of what is expected in terms of activities for policy outreach and dissemination.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Contact</th>
<th>Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Labour</td>
<td>Director of the Labour Relations Department: B. Alimaa</td>
<td>Labour policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institute for Labor Studies</td>
<td>Director: M. Chimedдорж</td>
<td>Labour promotion activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour Research Institute</td>
<td>Head of the Labour Policy Research Department: Ts. Bayarmaa</td>
<td>Labour researches</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• The potential users

Given the policy context around the youth unemployment in
Mongolia, the project will have the following key potential users of the research findings:

1. Ministry of Labour
2. Metropolitan Employment Department
3. Division of Employment of districts
4. Institute for Labor Studies
5. Young unemployed
6. Mongolian National Employers Federation
7. Research Institutions
8. Khorooos
9. Training institutions

The Ministry of Labour is one of important users as it formulates and implements labour policy and regulates the relevant bodies. If the ministry uses the research findings, then they will be included in its policymaking process. The other important user is the Employment Service Center (ESC). ESC is a government agency, responsible for implementing employment promotion policies. Therefore, the agency will use the research findings in its vocational training formats and designs. The third important user is the newly established Labour Research Institute. This is a state institute responsible for labour relation research and labour policy research. Therefore, the institute is a potential user of the research tool. Metropolitan Employment Department is the main body in charge of training program organization in Ulaanbaatar. The team contacted representatives from all these institutes. The team consulted with the them about our research and its importance for policymakers. Key stakeholders acknowledged the importance of impact evaluation of the labour promotion policy and a lack of research and study on labour market policy. They were very interested in the proposed research on impact
evaluation of vocational training, randomized experiment methodology and research results. Key stakeholders showed their deep interest in the proposed research and agreed to cooperate with the team.

In addition to the policymakers and researchers, taxpayers and citizens will gain the information on effectiveness of the vocational training on youth unemployment.

- **Engagement and Communication**

  **Workshops**

  The research team will be engaged and communicated continuously with the key users/stakeholders during the implementation period of the project.

  The key stakeholders will be:
  - Metropolitan Employment Department
  - Institute for Labour Study
  - Ministry of Labour, Employment Policy Department
  - Employment Promotion Service Center
  - Young unemployed
  - Mongolian National Employers Federation
  - Research Institutions
  - Training Institutions
  - Divisions of Employment of Districts
  - Khoroo offices

  The team will use various types of communication methods including email-list, roundtable discussion, workshops, academic discussion seminars, national and international research conferences and media. At the beginning of the project, the team will organize a workshop among key partners to inform about the research project and to
consult about their inputs in the project. According to new timeline, first workshop will be held in August, 2013.

During the workshop, the team will introduce about Randomized Control Trial (RCT), description of the randomization process, detailed plan of implementation of RCT, agreement and support with key partners and etc. In the end of the workshop, all parties will have the same understanding about the RCT and their involvement in it. In particular, they will understand the importance of not contaminating the control group.

During the project, the team will organize series of round-table discussions among key stakeholders to inform them about the progress of the project and potential problems to be solved.

6. List of team members

Indicating their age (or whether they are under 30), sex, as well as relevant/prior training and experience in the issues and research techniques involved (start with lead researcher). Note that PEP favors gender-balanced teams, composed of one senior (or experienced) researcher supervising a group of junior researchers, including at least 50% female researchers contributing substantively to the research project. PEP also seeks gender balance in team leaders and thus positively encourages female-led research teams. (Each listed member must post an up-to-date CV in their profile on the PEP website – refer to "How to submit a proposal")

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Training and experience</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

15
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Education Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ALTANTSETSEG Batchuluun</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>PhD in Economics, University of Virginia, USA, 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>M.A. in Economics, University of Virginia, USA, 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>MA in Economics, University of Manchester, UK, 1998</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOYOLMAA Batbekh</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>PhD in Economics, University of Manchester, UK, 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>MSc in Economics (with Merit), University of Manchester, UK, 2004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAYARMAA Dalkhjav</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>MA in Development Studies, Sophia University, Japan, 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>MA in Economics, National University of Mongolia, 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TSOGT-ERDENE Baldandorj</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>MA in Economics, National University of Mongolia, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMARTUVSHIN Sanjmyatav</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>MA in Economics, National University of Mongolia, 2010</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7. Expected capacity building

Description of the research capacities that team members (and potentially their affiliated institutions) are expected to build through their participation in
this project: This is an important aspect in the evaluation of proposals and should be presented in some detail. What techniques, literature, theories, tools, etc. will the team and their institutions learn (acquire in practice) or deepen their knowledge of? How will these skills help team members in their career development? Also indicate which specific tasks each team member would carry out in executing the project.

The research team consists of members with substantial experience in conducting sample surveys such as a simple random sample, two-stage random sample, stratified random sample and so on. Although, team members are familiar with experimental economics, they never used this technique due the high cost of the research. Conducting this study with randomized controlled experiment, the team members will deepen their knowledge of this new research tool and will gain an experience with support from PEP-NET. The team members will not only learn an important new tool, but also gain an experience on how to do a research at international standard. Therefore, main goal of the team is to produce a high quality research and to publish a research paper. PEP-NET support for participation in PEP meetings, study visits, working paper and journal publication grants and presentations in international conferences will allow the team members to reach the goal.

The capacity building in international research is the priority research strategy of the National University of Mongolia (NUM). Therefore, the departments of the university are actively seeking opportunities to enhance their research capacity and bring their researches at international standard. Therefore, the department of economics of NUM will gain from the project through the capacity building of its faculty members.
Capacity building outside the project

During the last decade, the government has spent tremendous amount of money to implement various policies to reduce poverty, to promote employment, health and education. However, there is a serious lack of researches on impact of these policies. This research will show the policymakers and researchers an appropriate tool for impact evaluation of policies.

Besides the capacity building of the research team, the key stakeholders will have opportunities to improve their capacity building through the various engagement and communication methods. It will make a progress towards research based policy-making.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Task</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AltantsetsegBatchuluun</td>
<td>Team leader, Prepare work plan and develop stratification method and survey questionnaires Guide the data collection effort and oversee its effective implementation Oversee technical aspects including sampling, interviewer training, data collection, data entry and cleaning, and variable aggregation and descriptive reports Participate directly in the oversight of fieldwork, through site visits, review of progress and review of primary data Maintain relationships with PEP-Net, relevant other stakeholders Manage budgets and expenses. Data analysis and estimation Submit reports according to agreed-upon timeline. Ensure that appropriate resources are made available and managed in order to achieve the objectives of the contract</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SoyolmaaBatbekh</td>
<td>Researcher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role</td>
<td>Name</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Researcher</td>
<td>Bayarmaa Dalkhjav</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Junior Researcher</td>
<td>Amartuvshin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Junior Researcher</td>
<td>Tsogt Erdene</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8. List of past, current or pending projects in related areas involving team members
### Name of funding institution, title of project, list of team members involved

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of funding institution</th>
<th>Title of project</th>
<th>Team members involved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>National University of Mongolia</td>
<td>Consumer Confidence Survey in Mongolia</td>
<td>AltantsetsegBatchuluun, BayarmaaDalkhjav, AmartuvshinSanjmyatav, Tsogt-ErdeneBaldandorj</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open Society Forum</td>
<td>Consumer Confidence Survey in Mongolia</td>
<td>AltantsetsegBatchuluun, BayarmaaDalkhjav, AmartuvshinSanjmyatav, Tsogt-ErdeneBaldandorj</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dissertation</td>
<td>Labour Supply with Information Processing Constraint</td>
<td>AltantsetsegBatchuluun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macro development fund World bank</td>
<td>Wholesale Loan Demand in the Microfinance Sector</td>
<td>AltantsetsegBatchuluun, BayarmaaDalkhjav</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian Research Center</td>
<td>The vulnerability to poverty in Mongolia</td>
<td>AltantsetsegBatchuluun, BayarmaaDalkhjav, SoyolmaaBatbekh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Manchester</td>
<td>On the Macroeconomics of Microfinance</td>
<td>SoyolmaaBatbekh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Manchester</td>
<td>Red tape, Rent Seeking and the Distribution of Income</td>
<td>SoyolmaaBatbekh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Manchester</td>
<td>Intergenerational Transfers, Demographic Change and Income Distribution</td>
<td>SoyolmaaBatbekh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National University of Mongolia</td>
<td>On the relationship between microfinance</td>
<td>SoyolmaaBatbekh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source</td>
<td>Topic</td>
<td>Author</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian Development Bank</td>
<td>Triangular relationship between poverty, inequality and economic growth</td>
<td>Bayarmaa Dalkhjav</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian Development Bank</td>
<td>Food crisis in Mongolia</td>
<td>Bayarmaa Dalkhjav</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open Society Forum</td>
<td>Annotated Bibliography of Issues on Poverty in Mongolia</td>
<td>Altantsetseg Batchuluun</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

9. **Describe any ethical, social, gender or environmental issues or risks that should be noted in relation to your proposed research project.**

The survey will use informed consent, which is consistent with existing laws and rules on ethical social, gender and environmental issues. The team will carefully prepare the informed consent according to the statistical law and current guidelines. Each participant will sign the contract to participate in the survey after giving their informed consent.

Section B¹ - For projects using randomized controlled trials (RCTs) only

1. **The experiment/intervention**

   1.1. **Description of the Intervention**

¹ This section closely follows practitioners’ guide by Card et al (2011).
This research will evaluate the impact of short-term vocational training program on the labour market outcomes of trainees using randomized controlled trial method. We have the following two interventions:

1. Short-Term Vocational Training
2. Short-Term Vocational Training and Information about labour market demand

Description of the Short-Term Vocational Training Program

In 1990, Mongolia has implemented transition from a centrally planned economy to a market oriented system. During the socialist system, everybody should be employed policy was effective and there was no unemployment. However, with the transition process unemployment became a large issue in Mongolia. In 2003, Mongolian government has introduced three programs, a short-term vocational training program, a short-term skill-improvement program and vocational internship program. The first, short-term vocational training program (VTP), will be evaluated in this study.

VTP is available to the following citizens:

- Registered unemployed
- Person graduated 10th and 8th grade or just had finished serving mandatory military program and having no job and not enrolled in education program
- Person who is vulnerable to unemployment and
- Low-income self-employed person

Focus of VTP is unemployed, in particular, young unemployed. In 2011, annual enrollment was 8,000, out of which more than 70 percent was unemployed people. The Employment Promotion Fund of the government finances VTP and preliminary estimation of total spending was approximately 4.4 billion MNT (3 million USD) in 2012.

We will focus in Ulaanbaatar, where almost half (44%) of the population resides. According to the Metropolitan Employment Department, 7,000 people were
trained in 2012. Metropolitan Employment Department organizes the training twice a year, the first one is from April to June and the second one is from September to November. The registration of the eligible applicants takes place until the given number of slots on a specific vocation is finished. But registration process is stopped on 15th of November every year and all vocational trainings must start by this day whether the slots are filled or not.

VTP offers trainings for 46 vocations\(^2\) and the program pays between 140,000 MNT (approximately, 100 USD) to 220,000 MNT (approximately, 150 USD) for tuition. Duration of trainings is 20 days or 45 days depending on vocations. Trainees do not receive any stipend and any reimbursement of transportation cost. However, there is a special treatment for a vulnerable group person, who is a disabled or a released from prison or long-term (more than 6 months) registered unemployed. A vulnerable group person receives 3,000 MNT (2.1 USD) per day for food and transportation. Moreover, VTP pays additional payment of 30% to encourage enrollment of these people to training institutions. According to the data provided by the Metropolitan Employment Department, VTP has a very high completion rate. In the first half of 2013, 85.7% of trainees successfully completed the training. Moreover, female enrollment in VTP is relatively higher between 60 to 65 percent.\(^3\)

The Labour Promotion Service Center is responsible for the selection of the training institutions according to the following criteria defined in the “Labour Promotion Training Rule”: legal registration, quality of curriculum, quality of teaching, adequacy of training places and ability to places trainees into internships with registered employers. In 2013, 75 training institutions were selected for VTP, where approximately 15% is non-profit and 85% is for-profit institutions. There are total of 5100 available slots for trainees in 2013. According to the “Labour

\(^2\) Vocations such as cook, driver, hairdresser, construction worker and so on.

\(^3\) According to the Metropolitan Employment Department, high participation by female is due to the larger allocation of slots on vocations in service and production sectors where females are dominant. For example, in the first half of 2013, 200 slots were allocated on hairdresser, 180 slots on beauty maker, 220 slots on cooking and 200 slots on tailoring, where average number of slots is 110 per vocation.
Promotion Training Rule,

4, maximum amount of theory for training is 30 percent and the remaining part contains practical work and internship.

The Metropolitan Employment Department is responsible for VTP in Ulaanbaatar and does the following: registration of the selected training institutions, contract with training institutions, monitoring of curriculum, course outlines and overall training process, financing the training courses, distribution of training certificates and information dissemination and advertisement of VTP. The Metropolitan Employment Department signs a contract with training institutions and cooperates closely.

**Figure 1. Application process of VTP**

There are 5 (applicant, khoroo, district office, Metropolitan Employment Department and the training institution) or 6 (applicant, khoroo, district office, Metropolitan Employment Department, the training institution and the employer) agents depending on the type of agreement and 5 steps to be entitled to the training

---

4 Labor Promotion Training Rule was adopted in 2003.
 participation. At first, an applicant submits a simple application (an expression of interest) to the khoroo\(^5\) governor (an administrative unit). The khoroo governor will screen the applicant’s eligibility. An eligible applicant will be sent to Division of Employment (DOE) of district office. DOE of a district sends the applicant to Metropolitan Employment Department if there is a slot on the vocation chosen by the applicant\(^6\). Metropolitan Employment Department provides a certificate of entitlement\(^7\) to the applicant who must choose the institute within 30 days after the receipt of the certificate. An applicant can sign one of two types of agreements. A trilateral agreement can be signed between the applicant, DOE of a district and Metropolitan Employment Department. A quadrilateral agreement can be signed between the applicant, employer, DOE of a district and Metropolitan Employment Department. In case of the quadrilateral agreement, the trainee must find an employer and make an agreement that the trainee will be employed after the completion of the program\(^8\).

The Metropolitan Employment Department pays the tuition in four installments using certificate notes worth of 20,000 MNT and 10,000 MNT:

Skill 1: 25% (At registration of the Metropolitan Employment Department)
Skill 2: 25% (At the end of 1\(^{st}\) week (or 2\(^{nd}\) week))
Skill 3: 25% (At the end of 2\(^{nd}\) week (or 4\(^{th}\) week))
Skill 4: 25% (At the end of 3\(^{rd}\) week (or 6\(^{th}\) week))

---

\(^5\)The city of Ulaanbaatar is divided into 9 districts (duureg in Mongolian) which are further divided into 152 khorooos. 94 percent of the city population lives in the biggest 6 districts to where 138 khorooos belong.

\(^6\)Slots of vocations are distributed evenly to each district and are not transferable among districts.

\(^7\)The city department of labor is paid the tuition fee in 4 installments (by 4 certificates) based on the performance. The first certificate is provided to the applicant who must choose the institute within 30 days after the receipt of the certificate. The second and the third certificates are provided to the institute on a weekly basis for 20 days training (on a biweekly basis for 45 days training) when it is chosen by the applicant. The last or the fourth certificate is provided to the institute via the applicant after the completion of the training program.

\(^8\)The quadrilateral agreement is a new procedure that has been put in effect since the last year in order to increase the trainee’s probability of being employed after the training. Although it’s the responsibility of the trainee to find the employer, there is an incentive for the training institutions to help the trainees to find the appropriate employer. Metropolitan Employment Department transfers the 5% percent of tuition fee to the training institute based on the skill report which contains information about employment status of the trainees.
These certificates become a valid payment instrument only with trainee’s signature.
Description of the second intervention

The second treatment adds information about labour demand for vocations offered by VTP to the first treatment. In Mongolia, a mismatch on the labour market became an important issue lately. According to World Bank Report 2007, there are considerable skill mismatches in labour market of Mongolia. Firms have a hard time filling vacancies for skilled workers, which is mainly due to the lack of required basic skills of applicants, particularly among vocational education graduates. In addition, the report mentions that unemployment, job informality and skills mismatch are all interrelated challenges of labour market. Therefore, short term vocational training which provides hard skills for young unemployed is very important. The research team will prepare information which may help to increase trainees’ efforts. In order to prepare this information, the team will review researches and reports on return to vocational training and organize focus group discussions among young unemployed, employers and successful employees.

It is interesting to see whether additional information improves labour market outcome of trainees. The second intervention differs from the first with additional information about return to training and other useful information to increase job search intensity. The timing of implementation of this intervention will be discussed after focus group discussions.

1.2. How will this work

1.2.1. Who are the beneficiaries?

The beneficiaries of the experiment will be young unemployed between 15 and 25 years old, who want to participate in vocational training.

1.2.2. How will they benefit?

---

Young unemployed will benefit from obtaining a job and increase their income. In participating in the training, they will improve their skills and competitiveness in labour market, which will help them to find a job.

1.2.3. How do you draw the control group to which you compare the treated group?

The team carefully studied the current ALMP implementation mechanism and decided to focus on the short-term vocational training program. In order to evaluate the impact of this program the team will closely follow the existing government procedure. The team has a written agreement on close cooperation with Metropolitan Employment Department, which is the main organizing body of the short-term vocational training.

The team is planning to conduct the baseline survey at khoroo offices where the applicants go first. Since the khoroo officers check the eligibility of the applicants, the team will recruit khoroo officers as enumerators of baseline survey. They will be trained as enumerators (138 khoroo officers) and asked to interview those applicants who are eligible and also aged between 15 and 25.

In order to increase the number of applicants for the training program, the team will stimulate the target population by advertisement. Therefore, the number of applicants may increase more than the given slots of vocations. The number of applicants to be interviewed at khoroo offices during the baseline survey is 3600.

The random assignment of eligible applicants will be conducted at DOE of districts where applicants are officially told if their interested vocational training is still available. If a slot is still available for the applicant, DOE officer will send the applicant to a researcher who will randomly allocate

---

10Currently, none of the government agencies, the city department, DOE of districts and khoroo does wide range of active advertisement about the training program.
the applicant using random number generating program. Applicant will be allocated in one of the three groups: control group; treatment 1; treatment 2.

Those applicants who are allocated in the control group will be told that the slots are not available for the chosen vocation. The team will prepare a list of individuals in the control group and submit it to Metropolitan Employment Department. The department is agreed to keep those applicants in the control group for one and a half year by making slots not available for them. This means that these applicants will be kept away two times from the government funded vocational training.

Those applicants who are allocated in the treatment 1 will be sent to choose the training institutes and attend the training according to the regular procedure. But those applicants who are allocated in the treatment 2 will be invited to an interview in a room in DOE office and will be provided with some information on labour market demand in 2013. After the interview, the applicant will follow the regular procedure.

Randomization will continue until the number of respondents reaches the target sample size.

1.2.4. Who will do it?

Overall, the team will design and manage the experiment with a support of Institute for Labour Studies (ILS) and Metropolitan Employment Department. First, we will develop a plan for the experiment and operate according to the work plan. The team will develop the experimental design and its implementation plan in the field. Also, the team will be responsible for developing instruments for data collection. Before finalizing, the team will implement pilot survey of the instruments. For the baseline survey, the team will recruit khoroo officers as enumerators with assistance of ILS. The team will organize enumerators training for khoroo officers.
In order to implement data collection for the follow-u surveys the team will prepare and train enumerators and data entry persons.

Prior to data collection, the team will train enumerators for fieldwork. Enumerators will work take an interview using data collection instrument. In the beginning of the interview, enumerator will introduce the purpose of the experiment and ask an acceptance to participate in the experiment. In addition, enumerator will carefully explain each participant about the experiment and the random selection process.

Data entry person will be prepared by the training. After each interview, data entry process will be taken place. The team will analyze data and write draft and final reports of the experiment.

1.2.5. What potential problems do you foresee and how will you overcome these?

One potential problem is a low completion rate as a participant may not register for the program (no-shows) or a participant may drop out of the program before completion (dropouts). According to Card, Ibarra-Ran and Villa (2011), it is very rare to achieve a completion rate over 80%, and rates low as 50% is common.

The team understands that there is a problem of incompliance as participants in the control group may manage to enrol in a similar training program (cross-over). In order to prevent this to happen, the team has agreed with the Metropolitan Employment Department to keep away the participants in the control group from the vocational training funded by the government. The team will prepare the list of participants in the control group and submit it to the department to ensure that the control group is not contaminated during the project implementation.
Although the team implements all these actions to increase the completion rate, the team understands that there is still a risk of no-shows, dropouts and cross-over. Following the guidelines by Card, Ibarraran and Villa (2011), the team will keep following all the participants of the study including the no-shows, dropouts and cross-over.

Third, there is a potential problem of site variation. The participants will be recruited from allkhoros and the short-term vocational training is expected to be organized at multiple sites. We will maintain balance across sites between the treatment and control groups as suggested in Card, Ibarraran and Villa (2011). Site information will be collected for both treatment and control group.

Fourth, some of the participants of the study may not be reachable during the follow-up surveys. In order to make sure higher response rate, the team will develop a separate plan for tracking the participants.

2. Data collection methods

2.1. Will a baseline data be collected or will you use existing data for the baseline?

Since there is no existing data for baseline, the team will conduct a baseline survey before random assignment. A questionnaire of baseline survey will include questions for the following characteristics:

- Basic individual information: Age, gender, education, marital status, dwelling type, health status, experience
- Family characteristics: number of children, number of dependents, household’s income, assets, other benefits
- Information on employment and earnings: previous and current employment status (unemployed/registered unemployed),
• Contact information in order to be in contact with participants: copy of valid identity card, phone number, relatives’ phone number, address etc.
• The purpose of the obtaining vocational skill
• Previous experience of vocational training
• Information about friends and relatives who are enrolled in the same program

2.2. What population will be studied?

Eligible population of the experiment is unemployed youth aged between 15 and 25, which is the subpopulation of the short term vocational program of the Government. The team will evaluate short and long run impacts of this program on likelihood of employment of young unemployed.

According to the Law on Employment, the objective of short term vocational training is to encourage employment through skill improvement. The short term vocational training program focused on the following groups of population:

• Unemployed
• Vulnerable to unemployment
• Person with difficulty to find a job
• School dropouts, who is in labour force.

The share of the unemployed is the largest in this population. According to Guidance on Employment Training approved by National Board of Employment, at least 70 percent of training participants should be registered as unemployed at Labour Exchange Central Office. According to Labour Market Survey of the Labour Promotion Center, there are 44 thousand registered unemployed people in Mongolia, in 2011, which is 5.5 percent of labour force. Out of them, 17.8 thousand people are registered in Ulaanbaatar, the capital city of Mongolia. 25.7 percent of registered unemployed is youth between 15 and 24 ages and 55.8 percent of unemployed has lower than technical and vocational training. For the
experiment, the team will choose young registered unemployed to evaluate an impact of vocational training program on employment and income/earning.

2.3. Sampling design, sample size and statistical power

**Sampling design:**

The team will closely work with khoroos, the smallest administrative unit in Ulaanbaatar (see appendix for administrative structure). According to the procedure, applicants go to khoroo office first. Therefore, the team is planning to conduct the baseline survey at khoroo offices among 3600 young unemployed at this first stage. Then, applicants go the Division of Employment of districts where we will do the randomization on a daily basis.

All slots of vocations are distributed to every district evenly. Slots are not transferable among districts. Given this, the team is planning to select 50% more participants than the given slot for each vocation. For example, for 50 slots of hairdressing vocation, there will be 75 participants will be selected. Out of which 25 will be randomly allocated to the control, 25 to the treatment 1 and 25 to the treatment 2. In this way, the team will select 1551 participants including the ones in the control group, at district offices. That means 517 participants will be selected to each group.

**Sample size**

According to the implementation plan, 3600 young unemployed will be interviewed for the baseline survey. But follow-up survey, 1551 will be interviewed. The research team proposes to test a hypothesis that the impact of short-term vocational training program on youth employment is at least 5 percent. That means there is a 5 percent difference in employment status of the treatment and control groups.

According to the Labor Promotion Service Center, 5000 individuals participated in short term vocational training. Approximately 41 percent were employed after the
training. Rough estimation from district data gives standard deviation 0.185 which gives the effect size 0.27. But the team chooses the effect size 0.2, a conservative number. According to the literature, drop-out rates can be higher than 20 percent. The team adjusts the drop-out rates at 35 percent. The number of participants, 1551, is calculated based on these numbers.

**Statistical power:** In order to prevent committing Type I and II errors, we choose a standard level for statistical significance, 5 percent and the statistical power, 80 percent.

2.4. **Key data to be collected (and how this will be done)**

The team will develop survey instruments in order to collect data. Survey instruments collecting data will consist of two types of questionnaires: baseline survey and follow-up survey questionnaires.

Baseline survey questionnaire will include questions related to background and primary variables. Background variables can be identified and measured, but cannot be controlled\(^{11}\). The example of these variables is individual characteristics such as age, gender, education, dwelling type, health status, communities etc. These variables will be used in an analysis and they will influence the outcome of the experiment. Primary variable is a variable of our interest. A questionnaire of baseline survey will include questions for the following characteristics:

- Basic individual information: Age, gender, education, marital status, dwelling type, health status, experience
- Family characteristics: number of children, number of dependents, household’s income, assets, other benefits
- Information on employment and earnings: previous and current employment status (unemployed/registered unemployed),

---

\(^{11}\) “Concepts of Experimental Design”, Design Institute for Six sigma, 2005
Contact information in order to be in contact with participants: copy of valid identity card, phone number, relatives’ phone number, address etc. The purpose of the obtaining vocational skill

- Previous experience of vocational training
- Information about friends and relatives who are enrolled in the same program

In both baseline survey and follow-up questionnaires, there will be questions related to employment status, search process of a job. In data collection process, the team will collect key data to analyze employment rates and earnings of both treatment and control groups. Moreover, follow-up surveys will be conducted also among no shows, drop-outs and cross-over participants as well as the realized treatment and control groups at the final stage of the experiment. Thus, it will provide us opportunity to compare all groups and test the difference between groups. The following data will be collected during the follow-up survey to capture changes in outcome variables—employment status, earnings and formality of employment:

- Employment status - whether youth is employed or not
  - Formality of employment – if employed, whether some part of workers’ social security contribution and income tax is paid by employers or not (for formal job)
  - Self-employed – whether youth is self-employed or not
- Total earnings per month - if employed, how much is his/her earnings per month
- Hours of work – if employed, how many hours he/she works per week
- Firm (employer) size defined by the number of employee

2.5. Additional data to be collected

To conduct labour market analysis and exploit specific feature of Mongolian labour market data, the team will collect additional data from Labour Force
Surveys and Population Census conducted by NSO, and other secondary source data and information from Ministry of Labour, Labour Exchange Central Office, Employment Service Center and ILO.

3. Modeling and testing

3.1. What model/idea will you test with these methods?

Generally, the research team assumes that the short-term vocational training increases the probability of youth employment. More specifically, the research team proposes to test a hypothesis that the impact of short-term vocational training program on youth employment is at least 5 percent. That means there is a 5 percent difference in employment status of the treatment and control groups. Since the sample size allows us to test the impact of training starting from 5 percent at minimum, we can test the impact of higher than this.

The other assumptions to be tested are about the program impact on the earnings and formality of the employment. Based on qualitative and quantitative data that will be collected during baseline and follow-up surveys, the team will be able to test the difference in earnings and probability to be employed in formal sector. Since participants will be asked about their income tax payment and social security contribution, payment of tax and social security contribution will be the indicator for formality of employment.

**Outcomes description and measurement**

Our research question is “Does short-term vocational training program alone and combined with information on labour market demand increase the likelihood of employment of young unemployed in short and long-run?” As mentioned above, the team proposes to test a hypothesis that the short-term vocational training increases the probability of youth employment.

According to our intervention, there are two types of treatment for young unemployed. First is the short term vocational training program. The short term
vocational training will increase competitiveness of young unemployed on the labour market and hence, the likelihood of being employed.

The second treatment is provision of information about labour market demand as well as the short term vocational training. If youth uses this information and decides to select a vocation with high demand in labour market, then the likelihood of being employed may increase.

In order to evaluate the impact of training, the team proposes the following measures of employment outcomes:

- Employment status - whether youth is employed or not
  - Formality of employment – if employed, whether some part of workers’ social security contribution and income tax is paid by employers or not (for formal job)
  - Self-employed – whether youth is self-employed or not

- Total earnings per month - if employed, how much is his/her earnings per month
- Hours of work – if employed, how many hours he/she works per week
- Firm (employer) size defined by the number of employee

In both baseline survey and follow-up questionnaires, there will be questions related to all these variables. In data collection process, the team will collect key data to analyze these variables of both treatment and control groups. Moreover, follow-up surveys will be conducted also among no shows, drop-outs and cross-over participants as well as the realized treatment and control groups at the final stage of the experiment. Thus, it will provide us opportunity to compare all groups and test the difference between groups.

To conduct labour market analysis and exploit specific feature of Mongolian labour market data, the team will collect additional data from Labour Force Surveys and Population Census conducted by NSO, and other secondary source data and information from Ministry of Labour, Labour Exchange Central Office, Employment Service Center and ILO.
The results chain

Lack of relevant skills, training opportunities and work experiences are linked to high unemployment rate among young people.\textsuperscript{12} According to labour experts at the Labour Research Institute, a major reason for high youth unemployment in Mongolia is lack of skills and work experience. Short-term vocational training program will result in more than a thousand trained young unemployed with short term work experience through internship (See Figure2). In the short run, the project is expected to have the following outcomes:

• Young unemployed with new vocational skill
• Increased effort in job search
• Trainees will be well informed about job market
• Increased match to suitable employers

In the long run, the research team assumes that the short-term vocational training increases the probability of youth employment. The other program impacts are increased earnings and formality of the employment.

\textsuperscript{12} Resolutions adapted by International Labor Conference at its 93\textsuperscript{rd} session, Geneva, June 2005, ILO
3.2. What empirical methods will you use to do this testing?

The research team is planning to use simple OLS to estimate the impact after the careful analysis and cleaning of the data. Once it is proved that there is no problem of randomization the research team will estimate the impact with a simple univariate specification that has only one dummy variable for treatment status at first hand. Then models will be adjusted by including baseline characteristics in order to have more precise estimation.

There are three outcomes of interest - (1) employment status (2) earnings and (3) formality of the employment – that will be regressed on the treatment status and other baseline characteristics. Models will be specified as the following:

\[
E = \alpha_1 + \alpha_2 D + \sum_{k=3}^{n} \alpha_k X_k + e \quad (1)
\]
\[
I = \beta_1 + \beta_2 D + \sum_{k=3}^{n} \beta_k X_k + e \quad (2)
\]
\[
F = \delta_1 + \delta_2 D + \sum_{k=3}^{n} \delta_k X_k + e \quad (3)
\]
In equation (1), E, F and D are binary variables for employment status, formality of employment and treatment status of participants respectively and e is disturbance. I in equation (2) is monthly salary. Baseline characteristics are expressed by $X_k$s in three equations. $\alpha_2, \beta_2$ and $\delta_2$ will be the basic experimental impact estimates. Formality of employment will be indicated by the payment of income tax and social security contribution.

OLS estimation on the employment status and formality of employment will be supported by probit model to provide more precise information on the effect of probability.

A potential site difference could be caused by different quality of training centers. If any site difference is observed, the research team will check this site effect by constructing differences in outcomes by training centers and then taking weighted average of these differences. Weights will be the fraction of the treatment and control groups at each site. If a substantial site difference is observed, it should be taken into account for randomization check.

3.3. What empirical problems do you foresee?

Research team foreseethree potential empirical problems – (1) randomization (2) response rate to follow-up survey and (3) compliance and cross-over – that should be checked before the impact estimation.

Randomization

Research team will check the randomization by using probit model. Treatment status will be regressed on baseline characteristics. Probit model will be fitted for treatment group status. If randomization is administered correctly, then we will expect acceptance of null hypothesis (null hypothesis will be all baseline characteristics has no effect on the treatment status) by likelihood ratio statistic test or low value of pseudo R squared.

Response to follow-up survey


Typically, it is impossible to obtain 100 percent response rate of follow-up survey. If there is a different response rates in treatment and control groups, this differential response bias will not provide accurate estimates. In this case, the research team will use bounding procedure suggested by Lee (2009) which will produce a range of values for the impact estimate. If the response rate of treatment group is greater than the control group’s response, observations with the lowest (highest) values of outcome variable will be dropped from the treatment group to obtain the upper (lower) bound for the impact estimate. If the response rate of control group is higher, observations with the lowest (highest) values will be dropped from the control group to obtain the lower (upper) bound for the effect of treatment.

Research team recognizes that equality of response rates does not mean there is no response bias. Due to randomization, there could emerge similar response biases in the treatment and control groups (Lee and Lemieux, 2009).

4. **Collaborators/consortium arrangements**

4.1. Are there collaborators involved and what are their roles?

There is no collaborator

4.2. How will you resolve disputes?

NA

4.3. Past, current or pending projects in related areas involving team members: list with name of funding institution, title of project, list of team members involved

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of funding institution</th>
<th>Title of project</th>
<th>Team members involved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>National University of Mongolia</td>
<td>Consumer Confidence Survey in Mongolia</td>
<td>AltantsetsegBatchuluun BayarmaaDalkhjav</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organization</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Authors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open Society Forum</td>
<td>Consumer Confidence Survey in Mongolia</td>
<td>Altantsetseg Batchuluun, Bayarmaa Dalkhjav, Amartuvshin Sanjmyatav, Tsogt-Erdene Baldandorj</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dissertation</td>
<td>Labour Supply with Information Processing Constraint</td>
<td>Altantsetseg Batchuluun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macro development fund World bank</td>
<td>Wholesale Loan Demand in the Microfinance Sector</td>
<td>Altantsetseg Batchuluun, Bayarmaa Dalkhjav</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian Research Center</td>
<td>The vulnerability to poverty in Mongolia</td>
<td>Altantsetseg Batchuluun, Bayarmaa Dalkhjav, Soyolmaa Batbekh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Manchester</td>
<td>On the Macroeconomics of Microfinance</td>
<td>Soyolmaa Batbekh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Manchester</td>
<td>Red tape, Rent Seeking and the Distribution of Income</td>
<td>Soyolmaa Batbekh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Manchester</td>
<td>Intergenerational Transfers, Demographic Change and Income Distribution</td>
<td>Soyolmaa Batbekh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National University of Mongolia</td>
<td>On the relationship between microfinance and the fertility rate</td>
<td>Soyolmaa Batbekh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian Development Bank</td>
<td>Triangular relationship between poverty, inequality and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Bayarmaa Dalkhjav
5. Human subjects concerns

Explain how the project will comply with requirements of local ethics review boards (e.g., how will you ensure informed consent? how will you ensure that no one comes to any harm? how will you ensure confidentiality? etc…)

The survey will use informed consent, which is consistent with existing laws and rules on ethical social, gender and environmental issues. The team will carefully prepare the informed consent according to the statistical law and current guidelines. Each participant will sign the contract to participate in the survey after giving their informed consent.
6. Describe your expected timeline and budget

Table 6.1. Work Plan

The timeline includes all the activities related to implementation of RCT. A detailed timeline is shown in Figure 2. According to timeline, the preparation for RCT will start on August 10, 2013. At preparation stage, the team will do the followings:

1. Organize workshop among key partners,
2. Advertise short term vocational training program in order to stimulate the target population,
3. Develop draft of baseline survey questionnaire and
4. Prepare for data entry process.

During the registration period of training, from September to November, 2013, the baseline survey will be conducted. Following this, data entry processes will be undertaken.

The first follow-up survey will be organized between March and June, 2014 and the second follow-up survey will be conducted from March, 2014 to June, 2014. During each follow up survey, the data entry process and data analysis will be implemented. After each data collection and entry process, the team will prepare descriptive reports and documentation of the data sets.
Figure 3.
Table 6.2. Budget

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ITEMS</th>
<th>Estimated cost in CAD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost for preparation stage</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>piloting of baseline questionnaire</td>
<td>3500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertisement</td>
<td>8000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>enumerators training</td>
<td>3000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>compensation for enumerators</td>
<td>12700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>compensation for participants</td>
<td>5000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Follow up survey 1 cost</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>piloting of follow up questionnaire</td>
<td>1000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>enumerators training</td>
<td>1500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>compensation for enumerators</td>
<td>15000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>compensation for participants</td>
<td>3500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tracking cost</td>
<td>9000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Follow up survey 2 cost</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>piloting of follow up questionnaire</td>
<td>1000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>enumerators training</td>
<td>1500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>compensation for enumerators</td>
<td>15000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>compensation for participants</td>
<td>3500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tracking cost</td>
<td>9000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Data entry</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>compensation for data entry staff</td>
<td>3200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Administrative cost</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>office rent at labour centers for 1 month</td>
<td>2100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>transportation cost</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>communication cost</td>
<td>1000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>stationary cost</td>
<td>1000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SUB TOTAL REQUESTED FROM PEP</strong></td>
<td>100000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>In kind contributions</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equipment and office rental</td>
<td>9600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy engagement and communication cost</td>
<td>20000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td>129600</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Reference


The Law on Employment Promotion, 2012

Comprehensive Policy on National Development based on the MDG, 2008

The fourth national report on Millennium Development Goals Implementation, 2011, UNDP


The Report of Labour Department of City Governor’s Office

Human Development Report: Mongolia, 2007, UNDP


Labour Barometer Survey, 2010, MCA
Appendix

Administrative Structure

Ministry of Labour is newly established in 2012 and its mission is to ensure comfortable working environment and provide equal opportunity in the labour market, as well as to encourage employment by improving the access to and quality of employment service. The main organizations under Ministry of Labour are Labour Exchange, Center for Employment Service, and Institute for Labour Research.

The main implementation agency of short term vocational training in Ulaanbaatar is Metropolitan Employment Department.

Figure A1.
Dear Sir/Madam,

This is to confirm that the Metropolitan Employment Department has agreed to cooperate with the team of School of Economic Studies, National University of Mongolia (team leader Altantsetseg Batchuluun, Bayarmaa Dalkhjav, Soyolmaa Batbekh) to conduct the following randomized control trial project:

“The Impacts of Short Term Vocational Training Programs on the Duration of Youth Employment in Mongolia”

We would like to mention here that the short term vocational training is the oldest and the most active program on the labor market promotion. There is not any significant impact evaluation study on the program except some approximate statistics on the number of participants and their graduation rate. In particular, the impact of the program has never been evaluated by RCT. Therefore, our institute expresses strong interest to support the RCT project to be implemented by the team of SES, NUM.

Hereby we express our understanding of the nature of randomization process and willingness to support and cooperate with the team of SES, NUM. We understand that during the project those applicants who are eligible for short term vocational training will be randomly divided into the treatment and control groups.

The team has agreed to recruit enumerators proposed by the Metropolitan Employment Department from the registered unemployed people with appropriate skills.

The city department of labor has agreed to cooperate with the team, in particular to prevent applicants in the control group to be enrolled in the training program funded by the government during the research project.

Sincerely yours,

Tungalag Nyamaa
Director
Metropolitan Employment Department
Implementing Agency of the City Governor
Dear Sir/Madam,

This is to confirm that the Institute for Labor Studies has agreed to cooperate with the team of School of Economic Studies, National University of Mongolia (team leader Altantsetseg Batchuluun, Bayarmaa Dalkhjav, Soyolmaa Batbekh) to conduct the following randomized control trial project:

“The Impacts of Short Term Vocational Training Programs on the Duration of Youth Employment in Mongolia”

We would like to mention here that the short term vocational training is the oldest and the most active program on the labor market promotion. There is not any significant impact evaluation study on the program except some approximate statistics on the number of participants and their graduation rate. In particular, the impact of the program has never been evaluated by RCT. Therefore, our institute expresses strong interest to support the RCT project to be implemented by the team of SES, NUM.

Hereby we express our understanding of the nature of randomization process and willingness to support and cooperate with the team of SES, NUM. We understand that during the project those applicants who are eligible for short term vocational training will be randomly divided into the treatment and control groups.

The Institute for Labor Studies will cooperate on the preparation stage of the research and support baseline survey and follow-up surveys with its institutional support.

The Institute for Labor Studies has agreed to cooperate with the team, in particular to prevent applicants in the control group to be enrolled in the training program funded by the government during the research project.

Sincerely yours,

M. Chimeddorj
Director,
Institute for Labor Studies